DOUBLE UP FOOD BUCKS™

2012 Evaluation Report
Fair Food Network is a national nonprofit dedicated to building a more just and sustainable food system. FFN works at the intersection of food systems, sustainability, and social equity to guarantee access to healthy, fresh, and sustainably grown food, especially in underserved communities.

FFN implements model programs and brings the right people together to generate ideas, share resources, and promote policy changes to repair our food system.

To learn more, visit [www.fairfoodnetwork.org](http://www.fairfoodnetwork.org).

Fair Food Network’s Double Up Food Bucks℠ program “matches” Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) food assistance benefits spent at participating farmers’ markets.

Our goals are to increase access and affordability of healthy foods for low-income families and individuals and to create new sales opportunities for local farmers.

Double Up Food Bucks also provides economic benefits to farmers by increasing demand for local produce: Double Up Food Bucks tokens can ONLY be spent on locally-grown fresh fruits and vegetables, enabling the money to go directly in the pockets of local growers and food businesses.

To learn more, visit [www.doubleupfoodbucks.org](http://www.doubleupfoodbucks.org).
Access to healthy food is a fundamental building block for a productive life. While federal food assistance benefits are critical to enabling low-income families to buy food, the lack of access to healthy, fresh food contributes to poor health outcomes and increases the risk of diet-related chronic illness. Nationwide, there are almost 48 million recipients of Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP, formerly known as food stamps) benefits receiving $81 billion in federal food assistance. In Michigan, there are 1.8 million SNAP recipients, over 18 percent of the state’s population and considerably higher than the 15.2 percent national average. In Michigan, SNAP benefits are administered via Electronic Benefits Transfer (EBT) on the Michigan Bridge Card.

Fair Food Network’s (FFN) Double Up Food Bucks program (DUFB) uses existing infrastructure — farmers’ markets and the Michigan Bridge card — to:

1. improve access to and affordability of fresh fruits and vegetables for low-income families;
2. grow the local economy by supporting purchases from local farmers;
3. shift public policy so that future federal nutrition assistance programs can simultaneously address health, hunger, and nutrition and support a more sustainable food system.

Fair Food Network has contracted with JFM Consulting to implement a three-year evaluation to assess DUFB’s effectiveness in leveraging federal SNAP resources to improve access to fresh fruits and vegetables for shoppers on federal food assistance while strengthening and diversifying farm economies.

The primary objectives of the DUFB evaluation are to:

1. determine the effectiveness of monetary incentives to promote healthier food choices (as evidenced by food purchasing behavior) for SNAP customers;
2. determine the impact of the DUFB project on the participating markets, vendors and the local food economy;
3. determine the implications of the evaluation findings in relation to policy change and replication;
4. examine implementation processes, including social marketing strategies, and identify best practices for replicating the model.

FFN partners with a number of funders, market managers, public officials, and a range of other organizations to develop and implement this program and contracts with individuals and organizations to lead the communications, policy development, and evaluation aspects of DUFB.

The statewide communications campaign is partially funded by Michigan Nutrition Network, SNAP-Ed co-ordinator. Policy consultants monitor and manage connections and opportunities for policy education in both Lansing, MI, and Washington, DC.

Ultimately, this program, combined with policy advocacy efforts, will support a shift in food assistance policy to provide incentives for consumers to purchase fresh produce with SNAP benefits.
**Michigan — the Sales Leader**

Michigan continues to lead the Midwest in SNAP sales at farmers’ markets

DUFB is highly likely to be one reason why SNAP redemptions at farmers’ markets in Michigan are greater than in any other Midwestern state by a significant factor.

---

**Key Impacts**

- Total customer visits to participating farmers’ markets were double the number in 2011.
- 100% of farmers’ market managers would participate in DUFB again.
- 92% of farmers report selling more fruits and vegetables.
- 83% of farmers say they make more money at the farmers’ markets with DUFB.
- 28% of farmers plan to grow more produce next year because of DUFB and 29% plan to grow a greater variety.
- 96% of customers said they would participate in DUFB again and would like it expanded to more places.
- 78% of customers reported that because of DUFB they increased the amount of fruits and vegetables they buy.
- 81% of customers tried different kinds of fruits and vegetables.
- 69% of customers made more trips to the farmers’ market.

---

*Source: USDA*
**DUFB Overview**

FFN developed DUFB as an innovative way to encourage low-income consumers to use their federal food assistance benefits to purchase fresh, locally-grown fruits and vegetables at farmers’ markets. DUFB offers low-income consumers an opportunity to purchase more fresh produce by matching up to $20 in SNAP funds spent per market visit with tokens that can be redeemed to purchase more locally-grown fruits and vegetables. The project was piloted in five Detroit markets in 2009 and in nine additional Michigan markets in 2010. The first full implementation took place for the entire market season in 55 locations in 2011 and expanded throughout Michigan to 75 markets in 2012.

At the 13 markets in Kent County, vendors piloted an electronic system for distributing SNAP and DUFB benefits directly to customers using an electronic DUFB market card instead of tokens.

**Market Selection and Orientation Process**

Criteria for market selection include:

- geographic fit — whether the market is located in a specific geographic “pocket” or region (in order to provide a concentration of participating markets);
- prior experience distributing SNAP benefits;
- adequate volume of SNAP sales;
- ability to raise matching funds; and
- administrative capacity to implement DUFB.

Once markets are selected, market managers are invited to attend an orientation to provide an extensive overview of the program, including the evaluation in which they are asked to participate.

FFN actively assists communities in raising matching funds for DUFB. Community foundations are a primary source for those monies, and numerous grants from several Michigan community foundations support the program, providing an important gauge of interest in DUFB statewide.

Seventy-five markets (including 2 mobile trucks) were selected to participate in the DUFB program in 2012. For a description of the participating markets in 2012, see Appendix A.
Evaluation Overview & Methods

FFN has contracted with JFM Consulting, a Detroit-based firm with decades of experience evaluating health and food access programs, to fully evaluate DUFB. The three-year evaluation is primarily designed to measure the impact of DUFB incentives on participating farmers’ markets, farm vendors, and SNAP customers.

The evaluation has three applications:

1. It informs FFN of opportunities for strengthening the program and making course corrections along the way.
2. It provides the basis for replicating this type of incentive program in other regions.
3. FFN uses the evaluation results to inform the broader policy discussions taking place around the reauthorization of the Farm Bill.

Methods

JFM Consulting has assembled an evaluation advisory committee made up of key stakeholder groups to guide the evaluation and provide input on data collection methods and instruments and insight on findings.

Evaluation data are collected from all participating DUFB markets using multiple sources and methods, including surveys of customers and farmer-vendors.

The customer and vendor surveys were administered in person by trained community resident data collectors identified with the assistance of farmers’ market staff. A total of 298 customer surveys and 121 vendor surveys were collected in 2012. The evaluation also included a web-based, self-administered survey by 42 market managers.

The evaluation further drew from an analysis of DUFB program records provided by FFN from 2009-2011 and interviews with FFN staff and other key program stakeholders, as well as structured observations made at the markets participating in the surveys. (A description of the data collection strategy is provided in Appendix B.)

Guiding Evaluation Questions

1. What is the impact of the DUFB incentives on the purchasing habits of SNAP customers?
   • To what extent is the DUFB incentive program increasing the use of farmers’ markets by SNAP customers (both new and returning)?

2. What is the impact of the DUFB incentive program on vendors, markets, and the local economy?
   • To what extent do DUFB incentives contribute to the stability and sustainability of the markets?

3. What are the strengths and barriers, best practices, and lessons learned around implementing the DUFB incentives in individual markets and across different types of markets?

4. What are the factors, either positive or negative, that influence the use of farmers’ markets by SNAP customers?
   • What demographic differences, if any, influence the purchasing habits of SNAP customers?
   • What strategies are used to market the DUFB program to customers, and what methods are most effective at attracting SNAP customers to farmers’ markets?
   • In what ways are the participating farmers’ markets increasingly becoming social gathering places?
Evaluation Findings

Market Characteristics

Seventy-five locations participated in the 2012 DUFB program. The markets were spread across Michigan, with the addition of two markets in Toledo, Ohio. The most densely populated areas of Michigan, such as Detroit, Grand Rapids, Lansing, and Ann Arbor, had multiple participating markets. This allowed FFN to focus marketing strategies in these areas and, in some cases, fostered relationships between markets. Most of the new markets this year were located in Kent County, Detroit and the Southeast geographic areas.

In 2011, the 55 participating markets were categorized by size and area. This year a new typology was developed that is a mixture of size, location, traffic, and the extent to which the market is well established.

Approximately one half of all the markets participating in 2012 were managed by a nonprofit organization or business. About 18 percent were run by a Downtown Development Authority or a Chamber of Commerce, 16 percent were run by the city, and 13 percent were independently-owned farmers’ markets, run by a vendor board.

Double Up Food Bucks began at five markets in Detroit in September 2009 and grew to 55 markets in 2011. Between June and December 2012, it expanded throughout Michigan to more than 75 markets, reaching thousands of Michigan residents and benefitting more than 700 local farmers with more than $1.9 million in combined sales from SNAP benefits and Double Up Food Bucks.
2012 DUFB Farmers’ Markets: By Type

- **A**: Large, high traffic urban or near suburban market
- **B**: Small to medium urban, well established market
- **C**: Small, urban/suburban neighborhood — new or low traffic market
- **D**: Small rural town center market
- **E**: Medium to large rural town center market
- **F**: Farmstand/Produce market

Total Combined SNAP and DUFB Use by Year

- **2009**: 5 Markets
  - SNAP: $38,302
  - Double Up Food Bucks: $203,545
- **2010**: 15 Markets
  - SNAP: $1,307,548
  - Double Up Food Bucks: $203,545
- **2011**: 55 Markets
  - SNAP: $1,307,548
  - Double Up Food Bucks: $1,913,349
- **2012**: 75 Markets
  - SNAP: $1,307,548
  - Double Up Food Bucks: $1,913,349
DUFB Impact on Markets

In an effort to learn more about the impact of the DUFB program on farmers’ markets, a web-based survey emailed to 75 market managers was conducted in late September and October of 2012; the response rate was 56 percent. In addition to questions concerning satisfaction with the DUFB program, marketing, and communications, the survey was designed to capture observed changes in the market as a result of the DUFB program.

From 2011 to 2012, participating markets saw:

- an overall increase of 16% in the total number of SNAP users at markets;
- a nearly 50% increase in SNAP dollars distributed;
- a 54% increase in SNAP dollars redeemed.

Positive Perceptions of DUFB Impact on Markets

Overall, 89 percent of market managers either strongly agreed or somewhat agreed that as a result of the DUFB program, the market benefited from new customers, with 93 percent agreeing that repeat customers were returning to the market more often. And 78 percent agreed that people are not just looking—they are buying.

Challenges & Solutions

Challenges

In 2012, nearly 20 percent of market managers agreed that market traffic moved less smoothly with the DUFB token system in place than without it, and about 64 percent agreed that dealing with customers was more time-consuming.

Solutions

During the 2012 market season, Fair Food Network conducted a pilot of a mobile electronic payment system for processing DUFB in markets Kent County. Vendors were given smartphone devices to process payments at the point of sale to customers with a Bridge Card and an additional form of identification.

The benefits of using the electronic payment system were found to be:

- reduces the time spent by vendors and market managers counting tokens and computing sales;
- reduces the likelihood of DUFB being spent on ineligible products; and
- prices do not have to be in dollar increments.

The most common challenge for vendors in using the mobile electronic payment system was the reliance on wireless (wifi) connectivity, which is often a problem in open air farmers’ markets. Fair Food Network will improve the mobile electronic processing system in 2013 and continue the pilot in Kent County.
DUFB Impact on Vendors

Over one hundred farmer vendors completed a survey about their experiences with the DUFB program and its impact on their operations. As in 2011, vendors in all markets perceived the impact of the program on their sales as positive. More than 90 percent of all vendors, whether at rural, urban, or suburban markets, reported that they sold more fresh fruits and/or vegetables because of the DUFB program, and 85 percent reported making more money at the market because of the DUFB program, both measurements up slightly from 2011.

Vendors said they definitely sold more because of DUFB and were very happy with the results of the program. Returning vendors grew more produce this year, were happy to be part of DUFB, and were seeing increased sales. During 2011 and 2012, 45 percent and 39 percent of farm vendors respectively reported that at least one quarter of their sales were from DUFB transactions.

DUFB Impact on Customers

One of the primary objectives of the DUFB program is to understand the effectiveness of this financial incentive program to promote healthier food choices among SNAP customers. A DUFB customer survey was conducted at eleven market locations: seven urban, two suburban, and two rural. The total number of customers surveyed was 298.

The majority of customers surveyed (82 percent) were female.

Customers represent a wide range of age groups. The largest base of customers was in the 35 to 44 age group (23 percent), followed closely by 45 to 54 year-olds (20 percent) and 55 to 64 year-olds (18 percent).

DUFB Customers: By Race and Ethnicity

(n=293)
Because my farmers’ market participates in DUFB...

More new customers are coming to this market

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Agree</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither Agree/Disagree</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Repeat customers return to this market more often

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Agree</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither Agree/Disagree</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Disagree</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

People are not just looking, they are buying

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Agree</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither Agree/Disagree</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Disagree</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I sell more fresh fruits and/or vegetables because of DUFB.

In general, how much of your sales are through DUFB transactions?

Highlights of 2012
- 90% of vendors reported selling more fresh fruits and/or vegetables because of DUFB
- 86% of vendors reported that new customers shop at their stands or stalls more often because of DUFB
- 86% of vendors said they had more repeat customers because of DUFB
Because of DUFB I make more money at this market.

Changes Observed by Market Managers Since Participating in DUFB

- A more diverse customer base, including younger families and lower-income individuals
- More/new customers
- Increased EBT sales reported by vendors

Additionally, a few market managers offered insights into the effect the program is having on markets:

“[We see] a more diverse customer base – we are seeing a TRUE picture of our local socio-economic situation and a TRUER picture of who lives in our community now that ALL community members have access to buy at THEIR farmers’ market.”

“After the DUFB marketing campaign, we saw a significant increase in SNAP users at our market, which we noticed also increased the diversity of our customer base.”

“I think more people on food assistance are coming to the market because of the DUFB match.”
Encouraging SNAP Customers to Purchase Food at the Farmers’ Market

DUFB customers were asked whether it was the first time they visited the market, used SNAP at the market, or used DUFB. More than 85 percent of the customers surveyed across the eleven markets had been to the farmers’ market before. There were fewer customers who used SNAP and DUFB at the farmers’ market for the first time in 2012 compared to 2011, indicating a growing group of repeat customers year to year.

A total of 13,306 customers used SNAP for the first time at the farmers’ market during the 2012 DUFB season. Slightly more than half of the respondents indicated that DUFB was one of the reasons they were going to the farmers’ market. And the majority of customers (95 percent) found it easy to get to their respective markets. Ninety-seven percent of customers reported that it takes 20 minutes or less to get to the market (up from 80 percent in 2011).

During the summer, “the farmers’ market” was the most popular response (68.4 percent) to the question of where DUFB customers bought fruits and vegetables, a significant increase from 2011. Next was the supermarket or grocery store, followed by the large multi-purpose store.

Customers who have used DUFB more than once were asked whether their purchasing habits had changed. Overall, many customers credit DUFB for changing their purchasing habits:

- 79% of the respondents indicated that DUFB was “very important” in their decision to spend their SNAP benefits at farmers’ markets;
- 78% of customers indicated that they purchased more fruits and vegetables in general because of DUFB; and
- More than 80% of customers indicated that they bought different kinds of fruits and vegetables because of DUFB.

Market managers from participating DUFB markets were asked about feedback from customers. Some of their comments include:

“Many people had never been to a farmers’ market and they love it.”

“Customers like this great program that has allowed them to stretch their money to purchase items they could not afford.”

“Customers appreciated our educational component of teaching cooking, canning and preserving techniques.”

“The program has motivated customers to eat healthier.”

“They love this program and it helped feed their children when school lunch programs are not an option for a meal.”

“The program has allowed customers to freeze and can produce for the winter, and to buy fresh food at farmers’ markets.”
Overall Satisfaction with DUFB

Overall satisfaction among customers, vendors, and market managers was very high. Almost every customer and vendor surveyed (96 percent for customers and 99 percent for vendors) would choose to participate in the DUFB program again. These results from customers and vendors were consistent across all markets. All of the market managers surveyed (100 percent) stated that they would participate in the DUFB program again.

Vendor Satisfaction

In exploring vendor satisfaction with DUFB, our survey showed 99 percent of vendors would choose to participate in DUFB again. More than one third of all new markets felt that the interest of vendors was higher than they expected. Comments included: “(Vendors) said they definitely sold more because of the DUFB program,” and “they are seeing increased sales,” and “returning vendors grew more produce this year.”

The issues that concerned vendors in 2011 showed significant improvement in 2012:

- 88% of vendors “strongly agreed” that reimbursement was easy and timely, reflecting a 16% increase over 2011.
- 90% of vendors strongly or somewhat agreed that the rules about what the customers can purchase were clear, reflecting a 14% increase over 2011.

Customer Satisfaction

Overall, customers were very satisfied with the DUFB program. When asked whether they would recommend this market to others, 99.7 percent (291 customers) answered yes. In addition:

- 93% agreed that the selection, quality, and price of fruits and vegetables were much or slightly better compared to where they usually buy fruits and vegetables;
- 70% reported the price of fruits and vegetables is much or slightly lower at the farmers’ market than at other locations where they shop.

Market Manager Satisfaction

All of the market managers surveyed said that they would participate in the DUFB program again; they were seeing increases in customers, diversification of their customer base, and satisfaction from their vendors with the program. When asked their opinions about the support they have received from FFN for the program, market managers were generally very positive, although about one third felt that the time needed to administer the DUFB program was more than expected.
Communications and Marketing

The DUFB marketing campaign uses many different communications channels to reach key constituencies, primarily potential DUFB customers, farmers, and potential community supporters. Similar to 2011, in-person outreach, direct mailings, and working with the local community groups were considered the most effective strategies.

Activities in 2012 included:

- Direct mailings of flyers and brochures to SNAP and WIC participants in the targeted communities;
- Partnering with local or community groups;
- Radio ads in select geographic pockets;
- DUFB billboards in select geographic pockets;
- DUFB website, including video stories, news, etc.;
- Facebook/Google ad words to reach potential customers and supporters;
- DUFB signs and brochures for participating markets and participating farm vendors.

FFN focuses on intensive communications coverage (billboards, radio advertisements, and direct mail campaigns) in select geographic pockets (Detroit, Flint, Grand Rapids, and Lansing). Markets outside those areas are provided with flyers, signs and banners, website coverage, marketing language for newsletters and public service announcements, and DUFB canvas bags and vegetable peelers to hand out to customers. The Michigan Nutrition Network provides funds for the campaign as a social marketing effort. It links FFN to other nutrition education providers to generate more awareness about the program, helping to spread the word about the availability of DUFB.

The main goal of the DUFB communications and marketing campaign is to bring SNAP customers into the markets to participate in DUFB. More than 50 percent of customers surveyed indicated that DUFB was one of the reasons they were going to the market. Data show that the effectiveness of the communication strategy was due to a mixture of media rather than any one medium in particular, though direct mailings to SNAP customers were cited as excellent advertisements for the program. Another key audience that Fair Food Network worked to communicate with was Michigan farmers: FFN placed three articles in a Michigan farm newsletter to build awareness about the program with them.

DUFB Grocery Store Pilot in 2013

Multiple barriers prevent low-income consumers from accessing fresh produce in their neighborhoods; farmers, too, have difficulty connecting with the growing demand for their produce. In order to reach a broader section of SNAP recipients, we will be bringing the program to the places where most people typically shop – grocery stores.

FFN has raised funds to implement a DUFB pilot at three grocery stores in Detroit and has obtained a waiver from USDA Food & Nutrition Service for this groundbreaking work. During the course of the project, we anticipate that up to 5,000 participants will increase their purchase and consumption of fresh fruits and vegetables using DUFB cards at the participating grocers.
**DUFB Policy Work**

The policy component of the DUFB program concentrates on educating policy makers and stakeholders on the effectiveness of using incentives to encourage low-income families to purchase healthier food while also supporting farmers and the local food economy. FFN engaged with a broad spectrum of interest groups and presented program results to USDA and Congressional representatives. There is a growing interest in multidisciplinary approaches to meet the nation's pressing needs, and DUFB garnered significant attention and support in 2012.

In March 2012, FFN President Dr. Oran Hesterman presented data to the U.S. Senate Agriculture Committee illustrating the success of DUFB in Michigan. Case Visser, a Zeeland, Michigan farmer, spoke at a U.S. House of Representatives briefing later in the month about how DUFB had increased his farm income. The clear message was that local produce incentives for SNAP families offer a way to improve healthy food access while also boosting farm income and stimulating rural economic development. The 112th Congress concluded without passage of a Farm Bill, but the bills passed by the full Senate and by the House Agriculture Committee both included provisions creating a new grant program to fund projects such as DUFB around the country.

Agriculture and rural interests were impressed by the fact that 83 percent of farmers report that they make more money at the farmers’ market as a result of DUFB and that 92 percent report selling more fruits and vegetables.

Health and nutrition advocate organizations were impressed that 78 percent of SNAP families that used DUFB in 2012 reported an increase in the amount of fruits and vegetables they buy and that 81% tried different types of produce because of the program. Increased consumption of fruits and vegetables is a crucial first step to addressing the conditions that cause obesity and other conditions that are prevalent in low-income communities.

FFN partnered with Wholesome Wave, marketumbrella.org, and Roots of Change to gather data from representative incentive programs nationwide for a “Healthy Food Incentives Cluster Evaluation.” (For more information, please see http://www.healthyfoodincentives.org.) This evaluation demonstrates that DUFB’s positive diet and economic impacts in Michigan can be replicated in communities across the country.

In 2013 Fair Food Network will continue to build on the solid foundation laid in 2012 to increase knowledge about DUFB on a national level, cultivate support and collaboration with allied farm, health and economic development organizations, and identify ways to extend the program to more communities around the country.

**SNAP Incentives Create Jobs & Other Economic Benefits**

A $100 million federal investment in a national farmers’ market SNAP incentive program over five years, matched by an equal amount of local and private funds, could create hundreds of new jobs while bringing additional benefits to farmers, consumers, and local economies.

Benefits:

- Every farmers’ market creates an average of four new jobs.
- According to multiple studies, customers shopping at farmers’ markets also spend money at adjacent businesses.
- Michigan businesses could create over 42,000 new jobs and increase earnings by $1.5 billion if 20% of the food residents and institutions purchased was locally grown processed, according to a 2013 study.
- Incentive programs for SNAP families bring new customers to farmers’ markets.
- Farmers make more money at markets with incentive programs.
- Farmers hire more workers to meet increased demands.
Results & Recommendations

Overall, the DUFB program had a successful year in 2012. The number of farmers’ markets that offered DUFB climbed from 55 to 75, and low-income customers redeemed more than $750,000 in DUFB dollars for Michigan-grown fresh fruits and vegetables. DUFB had positive impacts on vendors, with a majority reporting more sales, a more diverse customer base, and a positive impact on customers, with approximately three quarters reporting more fruits and vegetables sold because of DUFB.

During the 2012 program season:

- SNAP recipients made 89,428 visits to the 75 participating farmers’ markets to take advantage of the DUFB program, more than double the number in 2011.
- Approximately 700 farmers sold $1.9 million of Michigan produce for DUFB and SNAP dollars.
- 15% of these customers were first-time farmers’ market customers.

There was an overall increase from 2011 in:

- SNAP users at DUFB markets (approximately 16%);
- SNAP dollars distributed (approximately 54%);
- DUFB dollars distributed (approximately 42%).

Evaluation results also illuminate opportunities for the DUFB program to be strengthened.

For Vendors, Customers, and Market Managers:

- About 18% of market managers agreed that market traffic moves less smoothly, and about 64% agreed that dealing with customers is more time-consuming, making the case for electronic transactions to facilitate implementation.
- Customers requested an extension of market hours, market days, and the market season, signaling their interest in further opportunities to use the program.

For the pilot test of the electronic payment system, results demonstrated the need to:

- Consolidate applications;
- Improve wireless capabilities;
- Provide ongoing, intensive training.

In Communications and Marketing, suggestions included:

- Create signs and flyers to customers and vendors with clearer and simpler messaging;
- Develop DUFB materials in other languages.
Double Up Food Bucks Funders

We are pleased to acknowledge the generosity of private and community foundations, corporations, and government agencies that play a role in supporting Double Up Food Bucks.

Americana Foundation
Ann Arbor Area Community Foundation
Bank of America
Battle Creek Community Foundation
Bay Area Community Foundation
Capital Region Community Foundation
Community Foundation for Southeast Michigan
C.S. Mott Foundation
Erb Family Foundation
Four County Community Foundation
Grand Rapids Community Foundation
Irving S. Gilmore Foundation
The Jewish Fund
John S. and James L. Knight Foundation
Kresge Foundation
Local Initiatives Support Corporation (LISC)
McGregor Fund
Michigan Dept of Agriculture & Rural Development
Michigan Department of Human Services
Michigan Nutrition Network
New Hampshire Charitable Foundation
Newman's Own Foundation
Open Society Foundations
Osprey Foundation
Robert Wood Johnson Foundation
Ruth Mott Foundation
Saginaw Community Foundation
Slemons Foundation
Toledo Community Foundation
United Way of Greater Toledo
United Way for Southeastern Michigan
University of Toledo
U.S. Department of Agriculture
Utopia Foundation
W.K. Kellogg Foundation
Whole Foods Market
Wholesome Wave
Woodcock Foundation
Appendices
Appendix A

2012 DUFB Markets

Seventy-five farmers’ markets (including 2 mobile trucks) participated in DUFB, an increase of 20 from 2011 (see list below). About 40 of the markets had also participated in DUFB in 2011. Approximately one-quarter of the markets were small, urban or suburban neighborhood markets, one-quarter were small to medium urban well-established markets, another quarter were small rural town center markets. The others were large, high traffic markets, and a small number of larger rural markets and farm stands. By far, the largest of the participating markets is Eastern Market in Detroit; the other large markets are in the more densely populated areas such as Ann Arbor, Saginaw, Flint, Kalamazoo, Lansing, Grand Rapids, and Toledo.

Acceptance of SNAP Benefits

Farmers’ markets were not required to have previous experience with SNAP to participate in Double Up Food Bucks as long as they were prepared to start accepting SNAP benefits by June 2012. Almost two-thirds of the markets had been accepting SNAP for one year before 2012. Eight markets had been accepting SNAP for two years, five markets for three years, and nine markets were new to accepting SNAP.

2012 Participating Sites

Detroit Area
- Detroit Eastern Market
- Eastern Market Farm Stand Sites
- Eastside Farmers Market
- Farmers & Artisans Market – Dearborn
- Gleaners Fresh Food Share Program
- Lincoln Park Farmers Market
- New Baltimore Farmers Market
- Northwest Detroit Farmers Market
- Oakland Avenue Farmers Market
- Peaches & Greens Store and Mobile Food Truck
- Sowing Seeds Growing Futures Farmers Market
- Wayne Metropolitan CAA Farmers Market
- Wayne State University Farmers Market

Southeast
- Ann Arbor Farmers Market
- Canton Farmers Market
- Downtown Jackson Grand River Farmers Market
- Downtown Ypsilanti Farmers Market
- Dundee Farmers Market
- Green Market at Allegiance Health
- Monroe Farmers Market
- Westside Farmers Market
- Ypsilanti Depot Town Farmers Market

Southwest Michigan
- 100-Mile Market
- Battle Creek Farmers Market
- Bellevue Farmers Market
- Benton Harbor Farmers Market
- City of Springfield Farmers Market
- Douglass Farmers Market
- Kalamazoo Farmers Market
- VA Hospital Farmers Market

Greater Grand Rapids
- Ada Farmers Market
- Byron Farmers Market
- Downtown Big Rapids Farmers Market
- Fulton Street Farmers Market
- Greenville Farmers Market
- Holland Farmers Market
- Hudsonville Farmers Market
- Metro Health Farmers Market
- Muskegon Farmers Market
- Plainfield Twp Farmers Market
- South East Area Farmers Market – Garfield Park
- South East Area Farmers Market – Gerald R Ford Middle School
- Sparta Farmers Market
- Spectrum Health's Farmers Market
- Sweetwater Local Foods Market
- YMCA of Greater Grand Rapids Farmers Market

Lansing Area
- Allen Street Farmers Market
- Bath Farmers Market
- Downtown Owosso Farmers Market
- East Lansing Farmers Market
- Lansing City Market
- Meridian Township Farmers Market
- South Lansing Community Farmers Market
- Westside Farmers Market – Lansing

East Central
- Flint Farmers Market
- City of Grand Blanc Farmers Market
- Downtown Bay City Farmers Market
- Downtown Saginaw Farmers Market
- Imlay City Farmers Market
- Lapeer Farmers Market
- Northeast Michigan Regional Farm Market: East Tawas
- Northeast Michigan Regional Farm Market: Oscoda
- Vantage Point Farmers Market

Northwest Michigan
- Elberda Farmers Market
- Grow Benzie Farmers Market
- Lake Leelanau Farmers Market
- Manistee Community Kitchen Local Food Share Program
- Manistee Farmers Market
- Marvin's Garden Spot
- Sara Hardy Downtown Farmers Market
- Suttons Bay Farmers Market

Northern Michigan and the Upper Peninsula
- Marquette Farmers Market
- Menominee Historic Downtown Farmers Market
- Northeast Michigan Regional Farm Markets

Toledo, Ohio
- Toledo Downtown Farmers Market
- Westgate Farmers Market at Elder Beerman's
Appendix B

DUFB Data Collection Strategy

The DUFB evaluation involves the collection of quantitative and qualitative data from a variety of sources over three years, beginning with the 2011 market season. Data come from surveys and interviews of SNAP customers, farmer vendors, market managers, FFN staff, and key stakeholders, as well as from FFN program records.

DUFB Customer Survey

A survey of DUFB customers uncovers the strengths, limitations and impact of the DUFB program from the standpoint of the customer, including:

- Changes in purchases of fruits and vegetables
- Ease of use of DUFB and general satisfaction with the program
- Demographic information

The survey was administered at 11 of the 75 participating farmers’ markets; sites were selected to reflect the diverse mix of markets participating in the DUFB program. The 11 participating markets included:

- Allen Street Farmers’ Market (Lansing)
- Eastern Market (Detroit)
- Northwest Detroit Farmers’ Market
- Canton Farmers’ Market
- Dundee Farmers’ Market
- Flint Farmers’ Market
- Toledo Farmers’ Market
- Menominee Historic Downtown Farmers’ Market
- City of Springfield Farmers’ Market
- YMCA of Greater Grand Rapids Farmers’ Market
- Downtown Saginaw Farmers’ Market Incorporated

Developed with input from FFN staff and the Evaluation Advisory Committee, the customer survey instrument was designed to be administered by a trained interviewer at the market. In keeping with the participatory nature of the evaluation, the evaluation team worked with the markets and local community-based organizations to identify two to eight local residents, depending upon the size of the farmers’ market, who could be trained as data collectors to administer the survey. Data collectors participated in a two-hour training session conducted by members of the JFM evaluation team. The training provided a detailed overview of the data collection process and included role plays using the DUFB customer survey. Community data collectors conducted customer surveys over three to four hours during the market. Members of the evaluation team were on hand to provide any assistance, if needed, and to ensure adherence to protocols.

Surveys were conducted in September 2012 at the 11 designated markets. 298 customer surveys were completed.

DUFB Vendor Survey

The evaluation of the DUFB program also included surveys of participating farm vendors. The vendor survey was designed to identify the strengths, limitations and impact of DUFB from the standpoint of the market vendor through questions related to:

- overall experience participating in the DUFB program;
- impact of the DUFB program on sales and operations;
- issues or challenges related to participation;
- recommendations for improving the program.

Similar to the customer survey, community data collectors were trained to administer the vendor surveys under the supervision of the evaluation team. A total of 121 surveys were collected in September 2012 at the same 11 market sites as above.

DUFB Market Manager Survey

The third survey conducted as part of the DUFB evaluation was a self-administered, web-based survey of farmers’ market managers. This survey was designed to capture information around areas such as:

- program support from FFN;
- impact on market operations;
- advertising and marketing strategies;
- suggestions for strengthening or improving the DUFB program.

Conducted in late September and October 2012, the market manager survey went out by email to all 75 managers whose markets had been participating in the DUFB program since the beginning of the market season. A total of 42 surveys were completed for a 56 percent response rate.